Place Name SUMMARY (PNS) 5.4.1/02

'PARANANACOOKA'

(last edited: 11/3/2013)

Abstract

'Parananacooka' is the standard version of an Aboriginal name as recorded by the first surveyors in about 1840, and applied by them to the main river at Second Valley.

Its language is uncertain and its meaning unknown.

Some records suggest that very early in settlement history there may possibly have been an abridged alternative form 'Panacooka' or 'Panacooco'.

In the 1930s Tindale's Ngarrindjeri informant Milerum claimed that the first two syllables were really 'Panara-', not 'Parana-', and gave two Ngarrindjeri adaptations of the name; but it is not certain whether these derive from a memory of the early name or are merely a 20th-century Ngarrindjeri interpretation of the name printed on a map.

Tindale interpreted Milerum's two Ngarrindjeri versions ('Panaranakuna' and 'Panaranakuko') as 'pudenda and excreta of the Autumn Star women' with the connotation of 'brackish water in autumn'; but these derivations are of uncertain origin and may be Tindale's own speculations.

Noel Webb's alleged derivation, 'river of the native pine', is linguistically impossible.

Coordinates	-35.526232° Latitude, 138.22821° Longitude.

Language Information

Meaning	Unknown
Etymology	Unknown
Notes	
Language Family	Uncertain:
	probably Thura-Yura: 'Kaurna' OR Yaraldic: 'Ngarrindjeri'.
KWP Former Spelling	
KWP New Spelling 2010	
Phonemic Spelling	Uncertain
Pronunciation	Uncertain
Pronunciation tips	

PNS 5.4.1/02 by Chester Schultz 11.3.2013 1 of 12

Main source evidence

Date	1840? / 1841
Original source text	- [pencilled data] "Parananacooka May 12 40" [hasty scribble] "to the North Panal[?]coka" "Road from camp to Panacook[a/o]".
Reference	Forrest 1841, 'Road to the Inman', Field Book 63, GNU: [19, 21, 22].
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	Aboriginal survey guides 1839-40.

Date	1840
Original source text	"River Parananacooka".
Reference	Smith 1840, 'Plan of sections, in Districts F and D near Rapid Bay,
	Surveyed by Messrs Poole and Bryant, Augt 31, 1840; Drawn by W Smith',
	Plan 6/16A, GNU.
Informants credited	Surveyors Poole and Bryant.
Informants uncredited	Aboriginal survey guides 1839-40.

Date	1840 / 1844
Original source text	"River Parananacooka".
Reference	H Ide 1844, 'Plan of sections in Districts D and F Yankalilla and Rapid Bay,
	surveyed by Messrs Kentish Pool {sic} and Bryant / June and August
	1840 Nov 1844', Plan 6/15, GNU.
Informants credited	Surveyors Kentish, Poole and Bryant.
Informants uncredited	Aboriginal survey guides 1839-40.

Date	1844?
Original source text	"Coast scene near Rapid Bay at the mouth of the Panananakooka [sic], eastern shores of the Gulf of St Vincents, SA."
Reference	SA Museum listing of b/w photograph of original watercolour [March 1844] in George French Angas Collection Series Description: 11. Print held in box AA 8/12 which is lost [May 2010]. Holder of original w/c unknown [July 2010].
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	

Date	1847
Original source text	" a small cove near Rapid Bay, at the mouth of the Parananakooka
	rivulet, on the eastern shores of Gulf St Vincent"
Reference	George French Angas 1847, text with 'Coast scene near Rapid Bay', SA Illustrated, Plate XXI.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	

PNS 5.4.1/02 by Chester Schultz	11.3.2013	2 of 12

Date	1854
Original source text	"Panananacooka [sic] Riv."
Reference	Robert Stephenson 1854, 'Plan of the County of Hindmarsh', Adelaide, BRG 42/120/27, SLSA.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	

Date	[1850s] / 1923
Original source text	"Our 'river' was named Para-Narna-Cookah ; the name was really the biggest portion. The reality was just a stream, having sundry deep holes from which, with the aid of cotton, bent pins, and worms, we abstracted many small fish".
Reference	'WGR' [William Randall jnr], in <i>Observer</i> 31/3/1923: 51d.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	Randall family at 'Randalsea', 1850s.

Date	1923
Original source text	"Second Valley, called by the natives Panacooco At the head of the valley are two marble hills, one on each side, and at the foot of each hill is a beautiful spring of fresh water A long gully runs southward from the valley. The first permanent water in this was called by the natives Appadilla, the next Bullapunga (sic)".
Reference	Lucy Webb, 'Yankalilla Yarns' No. 9, <i>Register</i> 10/2/1923: 14g = <i>Observer</i> 17/2/1923: 51e.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	Settler memories.

Date	1934
Original source text	"Pa:naranakuna[illegible] / bad water the excreta of the autumn stars
	`Pa:na (?Pleiades)".
Reference	Tindale annotated map, Hundred of Yankalilla, AA 338/24/101.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	Milerum 1934.

Date	1941
Original source text	"`Pa:na`rana`kuko lit. pudenda of the `Pa:na women (autumn star)".
Reference	Tindale annotated map, Hundred of Yankalilla, AA 338/24/101.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	Milerum 1941.

PNS 5.4.1/02 by Chester Schultz	11.3.2013	3 of 12

Date	n.d. (?1980s)
Original source text	"Parna Kaurna Tr. Adelaide S.Aust. autumn when the star Parna is seen compare ['Pa:na] of Milerum and place name Pa:naranakuko. The place name suggests the Pleiades and heliacal rising in the Fall. / see Pa:na".
Reference	Tindale Kaurna vocabulary card, AA 338/7/1/12.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	

Date	n.d. (?1980s)
Original source text	"`Pa:na - Stars, the autumn women. Kaurna Tr. Adelaide Rapid Bay S.Aust. Example the place name for Water Reserve No.9, Section 52, H of Yankalilla. ['Pa:naranakuko] literally pudenda of the Pa:na or Autumn star women. Also named as [Panaranakuna] literally excreta of the [Pa:na] star. Parananacooka H of Yankalilla map syllables wrongly transposed."
Reference	Tindale Kaurna place-name card, AA 338/7/1/12.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	

Date	n.d. (?1980s)
Original source text	"Pa:narana`kuna Ramindjeri Water Reserve no.9 Sec 52 H of Yankalilla. Lit. excreta of the 2 stars Jupiter and Venus, wives of the ancestral being Ngurunduri who fled from him and were drowned while escaping to Karta or Kangaroo Island. Also known as Panaranakuko which see. Tindale ms."
Reference	Tindale Ramindjeri place-name card 588/5.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	

Discussion: 'PARANANACOOKA':

SOURCES, SPELLINGS and LANGUAGES:

The name comes to us from the first survey of the area south of Carrickalinga, by Kentish, Poole, Bryant and Forrest in 1840. For journalists, 'the Second Valley' was part of the 'Yankalilla Survey' which they reported as employing Aboriginal men on equal pay, like 'the Aldinga Survey'. Parananacooka' seems to have been transferred to our modern maps from those earliest plans.

PNS 5.4.1/02 by Chester Schultz	11.3.2013	4 of 12
---------------------------------	-----------	---------

Some of the other newly-collected southern names on those first maps are clearly Kaurna ('Bungala', 'Congeratinga'); confirming that at least some of the surveyors' guides were Kaurna speakers, and thus increasing the likelihood that 'Parananacooka' is Kaurna too.

'Paranana' does not occur as such in either language.

For credible morphemes which might have been represented as 'para', we have only *parra* 'tree branch' in Kaurna, and nothing in Ngarrindjeri.

For 'nana' there is only the Kaurna pronoun *nganna*, and nothing in Ngarrindjeri.

For 'cooka' we have *kurka* 'kangaroo rat' in Kaurna, and in Ngarrindjeri a late Coorong dialect word *kukar* 'native flax', which is not found in early records.³

If we allow that the surveyors may have mis-heard the final vowel (perhaps because it was slurred as a neutral ə), and that an o is supported by a couple of unreliable sources, then in Kaurna we have *koko* 'sick, sore, wounded; disease, plague', but nothing in Ngarrindjeri.

Not much sense can be made from those small results. Nothing else fits closely. No suffix resembling 'cooka' exists in either language. It begins to look like an impasse.

However, we may be helped out by some previously unknown recorded variants of the name.

In the earliest source – a field book of Sergeant Forrest (of the Royal Sappers and Miners who were brought out with Captain Frome in 1839 for the surveying) – we have measurement data roughly pencilled which give not only the standard six-syllable 'Parananacooka' but also two examples of an alternative form which is unmistakably in four syllables: 'Panacook[a/o]' and 'Panal/?/coka'.⁵

This form is unexpectedly supported by chronicler Lucy Webb in an essay published in 1923, citing not only an otherwise unrecorded local name 'Appadilla', but a four-syllable version 'Panacooco' for 'Second Valley', presumably from old settler memories independent of both Forrest and the published maps early or late.

These two sources are uncertain in quality. Some details in Forrest are obscure because of his semi-legible scrawl. The newspaper publication of Webb contains many spelling errors and we do not have her original manuscript.

There are two other doubtful early sources which also begin the name with 'Pana'.

According to a catalogue in the SA Museum, Angas's original inscription on his well-known painting of Second Valley at sunset reads (according to one catalogue) "Coast scene near Rapid Bay at the mouth of the Panananakooka" [sic]; but this variant spelling awaits confirmation, and differs from his published text. A relatively late map (1854) spells it "Panananacooka", but includes so many identifiable spelling errors on the rest of the map, even in English, that little weight can be attached to it. 8

There are no clear explanations in either Kaurna or Ngarrindjeri language for this collection of doubtful spellings, and it is hard to know what to make of them.

This has not stopped letter-writers and others from advancing casual theories with no credibility. The lawyer Noel Webb in 1931 passed the opinion to a newspaper columnist that "Parananakooka... means the river of the native pine tree". This is a pure guess which equates 'para' with parri 'river' and 'nana' with narnu 'native pine' (both Kaurna), changing vowels as if they had no significance (as if 'marry' were interchangeable with 'marrow'), and ignoring 'cooka' altogether. A word with the meaning of the alleged gloss would be Narnu-parri, with an optional suffix -ngga. But of course the reporter published this piece of half-hearted speculation, 9 with the result that Manning has reproduced it again in his massive semi-official work on South Australian place-names. 10

Such recycling of any old opinion has always been rife among collectors of place-names. Very few of them have felt an obligation to know more about the language than a word or two from the vocabulary before going into print; and their efforts have been rewarded with unanalysed immortality, even by comparatively serious researchers like Manning.

20th-CENTURY NGARRINDJERI VIEWS: MILERUM and TINDALE:

Tindale's chronic ambiguities and unfindable sources often make it hard to find out what his informants actually said; and even then, what they give us are often new Ngarrindjeri versions of pre-existing Kaurna names. They spoke Ngarrindjeri but knew very little Kaurna; and Tindale's glosses often add more confusions between the two languages. 11

But in this case it is at least possible that Milerum may have known something with a partly Kaurna origin, since he appears to be supported by Forrest and Webb.

Like many others, the primary record on Tindale's Hundred of Yankalilla map is brief and ambiguous. 12 There is a cluster of notes on this map. It appears that Milerum in 1934 corrected the established name 'Parananacooka River' – possibly after being shown it on the map 13 – to

PNS 5.4.1/02 by Chester Schultz	11.3.2013	6 of 12	ĺ
---------------------------------	-----------	---------	---

"Pa:naranakuna". In 1941 Milerum gave "'Pa:naranakuko" as an alternative which was then transferred to this map. The glosses which accompany the names on this map are probably not Milerum's but Tindale's, added later:

Pa:naranakuna / bad water the excreta of the autumn stars `Pa:na (?Pleiades);

and

`Pa:naranakuko lit. pudenda of the `Pa:na women (autumn star).

These notes seem to be Tindale's original source on which he based his later secondary records about the name. 14

ANALYSIS - SPELLINGS and LINGUISTICS:

Kunar is Ngarrindjeri for 'dung',¹⁵ as Tindale knew; it matches the well-established *kudna* in Kaurna. He says on a card that Milerum's *kuko* means 'pudenda', and that this interpretation is "based on [the] place name".¹⁶ This is surely a circular argument unless it was Milerum who glossed this version; yet this would be unusual for Milerum, and we are often fairly sure that glosses given by Tindale were his own desk work rather than reportage from his informants.¹⁷ We might give him the benefit of the doubt and surmise *kuko* to be a Tangani variant of *kūkake* which has a closely-related meaning.¹⁸ But this remains a guess.

It is at least as likely that Milerum was merely replacing the final *a* with an *o* to fit Ngarrindjeri language habits, in which very few words end with *a*. Tindale recorded elsewhere that Milerum gave *kukar* as 'native flax', ¹⁹ but never cited the word in connection with this place-name.

Milerum's correction of 'Paranana' to 'Panarana' does not make the word gloss credible in Ngarrindjeri. There we have *parnar*, 'rain'²⁰ (which Tindale should have noted but never mentioned) but *not* the autumn star. And the syllables 'rana' have no linguistic explanation in either language.²¹

His records glossed the 'Pa:na' in this name with the Kaurna meaning, 'autumn star'; and unless more information turns up in the 'Milerum Manuscripts' we have no sure way of knowing whether this came from him or from Milerum. In the light of his own admission about another word: "Presumably Milerum did not dissect the name", 22 one must suspect that it was from Tindale. The same caution must apply to all Tindale's glosses and all his hints about mythological sites associated with the Autumn Star. For the moment it remains unknown what significances (if any) Milerum attached to the name or the place.

THE PLACE: RIVER, VALLEY AND MOUTH:

The name almost certainly did not apply originally to the whole length of the river as we call it: this would have been a European-style generalization by the surveyors, as happened with other names, including 'Yankalilla'.²³ Probably it named a site on the river, but we can't know where with any certainty.

The first known record containing variants of the name is Sergeant Forrest's field notebook 63, and it was probably on this trip that the name was first collected. Here (as in Lucy Webb) it stands alone, not attached to the label 'river'. A sketch of Section 1568 (now Boat Harbour Hill) notes a "Road from camp to Panacook[a]". An expert examination of the book might reveal where they first arrived, where he was camping, and where 'Panacooka' was before it was co-opted to be the name of the whole river. But the earliest maps based on these surveyors' work already show 'River Parananacooka' along the whole length of the river as defined today with its source near Bullaparinga Hill.

At Leonard's Mill the river joins a tributary flowing from the south which provides the best route – for vehicles²⁵ – as followed now by the Main South Road to the watershed of the Yattagolinga River system. Lucy Webb recorded a spring 'Appadilla' somewhere on this branch.²⁶

The upper part of Light's 'second valley' has several springs which originate in an underground stratum of marble.²⁷ One is nearly a kilometre downstream on the tributary 'Second Valley Creek' on Section 1565.²⁸ By the creek junction at the head of the valley are "two marble hills, one on each side, and at the foot of each hill is a beautiful spring of fresh water",²⁹ "an unfailing spring of beautiful fresh water rising in a marble formation";³⁰ so that this junction was a strategic site for any journey southward. The springs are downstream a short distance north of the Main South Road.

Either Tindale or his other informant Karlowan misapplied the name 'Ityikawingga' to this site on Section 1564, where "spring" and 'Water Reserve" are officially printed on his working map. Tindale said that there was a campsite here, and its name was "`Itji`ka:winga" which means "first water". But, while the likelihood of a campsite is high, the rest of this bundle is doubtful.³¹

Inevitably these springs became the water supply for the first local farm: 'Second Valley', a sheep farm established by the brothers Henry and Frederick Jones in the early 1840s. Very few records have survived from the Jones era; but Trooper James McLean, of the Mounted Police, bodyguard for Governor Grey and his wife on their pleasure trip through the Fleurieu in early 1842,³² did record one incident whose actors could have been either Kaurna or Ramindjeri:

PNS 5.4.1/02 by Chester Schultz	11 3 2013 I	8 of 12

In the morning started for Henry and Frederick Jones' Station, 'Rapid Bay'. The last day we were here a native woman was bitten on the ankle by a whip snake. The men took her immediately and made a shade for her about 300 yards distant from the wurleys. On asking them the reason why, they said, 'By and by that one crackaback (dead) when sun go down.' and the poor creature did die in great pain in the evening.³³

Possibly Jones was employing Aboriginal labour; perhaps the group was merely employing the treasured spring site, with its teatree shade, on one of its regular journeys; or perhaps both were happening.

The property and spring were taken over by William Randall in 1850 and re-named 'Finniss Vale'. 'Old Colonist', visiting in December 1850, wrote, "Mr Randall intends to build a new house on site near his kitchen garden... A valuable spring waters this garden... Mr Randall had fired a tea-tree swamp of some extent". The old Jones-Randall cottage still stands there with its stone well, only a short walk upstream from the spring which I saw in the 1990s pouring out of the sodden river banks.

No doubt any valid gloss of an Aboriginal place-name would also have an ecological significance to the Aboriginal managers of this land. Writers with access to other Tindale material which I have not seen, have quoted him interpreting the connotations of Parananacooka as "the river stinks in autumn – undrinkable" and "so called because of the intense brackish water at the end of the river in summer". ³⁶

But this, his interpretation of Milerum's 'Panaranakuko', remains questionable. It appears to be in conflict with local knowledge from resident and historian Ron Blum:

During most of the year the watercourse, on reaching the old township,³⁷ is completely dry but after passing through the village, it surges back to life. This section running to the coast has never been known to dry up. The apparent metamorphosis is due to springs which cause water to bubble up 'magically' from the earth below.³⁸

If 'sick' did refer to brackish water (which we don't know), it must have applied either above the springs, or perhaps at the mouth when salt water may have seeped into the beach waterhole at times of minimum flow. If Forrest's 'Panacooka' turned out to be at or near the mouth, this would support Milerum's interpretation. More research in historical geography would be needed to confirm or refute this claim; but it must be regarded as unlikely in view of the nature and historical affirmations of the springs which fed the whole valley before dams were built.

There was another place-name nearby, "Cowyrlanka", which (despite its seeming connection with *kauwe*) probably refers to the cliffs rather than the water.³⁹

Probably in the 1980s during his intensive work on the proposed place-names Gazetteer, Tindale refined his ideas about the name's location to "Water Reserve No 9, Section 52 Hundred of Yankalilla", which is probably derived from the printed data on his working map, in Second Valley Forest near Bullaparinga Hill at the headwaters of the Parananacooka River. ⁴⁰ Again there is no sign of any evidence for this application of the name. It is another example of his tendency to record as established fact what was only his own speculation, and sometimes a temporary one at that, inspired by looking at a map.

Likewise, he attempted to relate this place-name to *Parna* – in Kaurna language 'a star indicating the autumn' – and other planets, obviously collecting items for a hypothetical Parna Dreaming line. But these undeveloped fragments are a jumble of incompatible speculations unsupported by any known evidence. An analysis of them can be found in the non-public Management File of this essay.

End of Summary

Tindale annotated map Hundred of Yankalilla, AA 338/24/101. I have not seen his 'Milerum Manuscripts' which may prove to contain extra primary information affecting the following argument.

PNS 5.4.1/02 by Chester Schultz	11.3.2013	10 of 12
---------------------------------	-----------	----------

Poole and Bryant / Smith 1840, 'Plan of sections, in Districts F and D near Rapid Bay', plan 6/16A; Kentish, Poole and Bryant 1840 / Ide 1844, 'Plan of sections in Districts D and F Yankalilla and Rapid Bay', plan 6/15, GNU.

² Register 10/8/1839: 6A.

³ Gale 2009 Naarrindieri Dictionary: 26.

⁴ Lucy Webb 1923 'cooco'; Forrest 1840 'cook' whose last letter could be 'a' or 'o'.

⁵ Forrest 1840?, Field Book 63: 19, 21, 22, GNU.

⁶ Register 10/2/1923: 14G.

⁷ George French Angas Collection Series Description: 11, SA Museum; cp. Angas 1847, Plate XXI 'Coast scene near Rapid Bay', in *SA Illustrated*.

Stephenson 1854, 'Plan of the County of Hindmarsh', BRG 42/120/27, SLSA.

⁹ Advertiser, 20/3/1931: 20g. Webb was the originator and popularizer of a number of spurious derivations for place-names around Adelaide and southward, especially through the Adelaide City Council's publication of his 'Place Names of the Adelaide Tribe'.

¹⁰ Manning 2006, Manning's Place Names of SA: 384.

See e.g. Karlowan's 'Turtatjalangga', in PNS 4.3.3/4 'Tartatyilla'; and Tindale on 'Bungala', in 5.2.1/1 'Pangkarla...

- ¹³ a method which Tindale often used with Milerum, by his own admission. See 'Place Names: drafts for text', AA338/10/2: 114.
- e.g. Kaurna place-name cards 'Pa:na' and 588/3 'Panaranakuna'; Kaurna vocabulary cards 'kuko' and 'kuna'; map County Hindmarsh, AA 338/24/121.
- Taplin vocabulary 1879.
- 16 Kaurna vocabulary card 'kuko': my emphasis.
- See e.g. Kaurna vocabulary card 'wito', which appears to cite Reuben Walker for the gloss 'basket-making reed'; and the card 'wate', which does the same for the gloss 'among'. But on examination, these both prove to be only a reference to Walker's place-name 'Wituwatangk' in SESA 2: 88, where Tindale recorded no gloss.
- Meyer, Ramindjeri vocabulary 1843, under 'kukake' and 'murle'.
- ¹⁹ Tindale Tangani vocabulary cards, quoted in Gale 2009, *Ngarrindjeri Dictionary*: 26.
- ²⁰ Taplin 1879, Narrinyeri vocabulary in *Folklore*.
- Parnar in Ngarrindjeri is already a plural, and so cannot be extended to parnarar.
- Ramindjeri vocabulary card 'wita'.
- 23 See PNS 5.2.1/2.
- This road is shown on Plans 6/16A and 6/15: it runs parallel to the cliffs from the Congeratinga River to the mouth of the Paranancooka.
- For foot travellers such as Aboriginal groups the easiest route was along the hilltops near the coast, as shown on Macpherson's Plan 6/16 'Plan of 13 sections in the country adjoining Rapid Bay' (1840).
- Lucy Webb 'Yankalilla Yarns' No. 9, Register 10/2/1923: 14g = Observer 17/2/1923: 51e.
- For the marble formation see Mulcahy 1992: 36.
- See 'Second Valley springs cave' in GNU website http://www.placenames.sa.gov.au/pno/.
- Lucy Webb 'Yankalilla Yarns' No. 9, ibid.
- Cockburn 1927, Pastoral Pioneers of SA 2: 173.
- Map AA 338/24/101 and Kaurna place-name card 482. More information might be available in the *"Tindale ms"* which he cites if it can be found; but the most likely source is Tindale's own theorizing. For the name 'Itjikawingga', see PNS 5.4.1/3 'Jaitjakawengga' and 5.4.1/12 'Ptyikawingga'.
- Date: During Grey's trip Pullen was found surveying at Goolwa, and Moorhouse was 'staying' at Encounter Bay after his marriage, probably on his honeymoon. Moorhouse married on 4/1/1842 http://adb.anu.edu.au/biography/moorhouse-matthew-4239 (21/8/2012). The date January 1842 seems to agree with internal evidence of dates in McLean's article.

Place: The Jones brothers also had land at Stockyards (Delamere), but their headquarters were at Second Valley (Roy Williams 1985 / 1991, *To Find A Way*: 30).

James McLean 1903, 'Police Experiences with the Natives', *Proceedings of Royal Geographical Society of SA* 6 (1903): 74.

- ³⁴ 'Old Colonist' 1851, ed. Yelland 1983, *Copper, Colonists and Corn* [2nd ed.]: 44-8. Randall cleared and drained 15 acres of teatree swamp (Cockburn 1927, *Pastoral Pioneers of SA* 2: 173).
- 35 Shirley Mulcahy 1992, Southern Fleurieu Historic Walks: 36.
- 36 Manning 2006, Manning's Place Names of SA: 328.
- i.e. Randalsea, by the Main South Road.
- 38 Blum 2002. The Second Valley (2nd Ed): 52.
- 39 See PNS 5.4.1/1.
- e.g. Kaurna place-name card 588/1 'Panaranakuko'; cp. Tindale annotated map Hd of Yankalilla, AA 338/24/101.